# Final Report of Results and Impacts

# **African Trade and Investment Policy Program for Mali**

Policy Analyses and Private Sector Strengthening

**SUBMITTED TO**USAID/Mali

# **SUBMITTED BY**

Nathan-MSI Group B. Lynn Salinger Associates for International Resources & Development (AIRD)

**IN RESPONSE TO** 



# **Summary of Results**

USAID/Mali's Sustainable Economic Growth (SEG) portfolio includes a policy analysis and advisory activity with the Ministry of Industry, Trade, and Transportation. This activity was implemented from February 2000 through December 2001 by Associates for International Resources and Development and Management Systems International, through the SEGIR/General Business, Trade, and Investment indefinite quantity contract, managed by Nathan Associates.

Seven different activities were undertaken as part of this \$500,000 task order, with the following results achieved by specialists from SEGIR/GBTI consortium partners AIRD (Cambridge, MA), GREAT (Bamako), MSI (Washington, DC), and Nathan Associates (Arlington, VA):

- The Ministry of Industry, Trade, and Transportation received its first assessment of the impact of WAEMU/UEMOA adhesion on the competitiveness of private Malian firms.
- The Government of the Republic of Mali (GRM) become the first sub-Saharan African country to submit an agricultural trade position paper to the World Trade Organization in advance of the Doha Ministerial, November 2001 (see Government of Mali. (2001) "Malian Proposals For The Future Negotiations On Agriculture." World Trade Organization, G/AG/NG/W/99. Submitted 11 January 2001 to WTO Committee on Agriculture.).
- Advocacy training was provided to three private sector groups (livestock producers, fruit and vegetable growers, and participants in the Office du Niger), which generated additional demand for such training by other groups (such as cereals producers) in Mali.
- Non-traditional, modern consumer goods (home decor items, leisure wear, and leather goods)
  made by Malian textile and leather artisans debuted at the August 2001 New York
  International Gift Fair, generating buying interest from several new American companies.
  These companies are now privately financing product development in Mali, imports, and
  exhibition of samples at the January 2002 gift fair.
- Timely policy guidance was provided to the GRM in December 2001 in response to a looming wheat flour sector crisis, which resulted from the adoption of WAEMU/UEMOA taxation guidelines on import protection.
- A study of the financial feasibility of creating a non-bank financial institution to promote investment in the Office du Niger will be undertaken by the GRM and donors in response to analysis demonstrating how such an institution might actually work.
- Field surveys of small-scale, artisanal mining highlighted the importance of non-agricultural noods of rural households in mining regions of the country. The study d to be sensitive to these interests as national mineral extraction policies

A number of these studies will serve as critical input into the development of a Trade Capacity Needs Assessment Report to be prepared for the Government of Mali with support from USAID.

# Introduction

USAID/Mali's strategic objective for sustainable economic growth is defined as "increased value-added of specific economic sub-sectors to national income." The Mission focuses on cereals, livestock, and alternative commodities such as fruits and vegetables, sheanut butter, and

other non-traditional crops. Much of the SEG office's portfolio is focused on the private sector through its Center for Agro-Enterprise project working with agricultural producers, processors, and traders; its support of extension work with producers through the Ministry of Rural Development; and activities relating to agricultural market information networks, business management for cooperatives & other rural civil society organizations, rice irrigation development in the Niger Delta, appropriate technology, pesticide research, and micro-finance sector development.

Policy work with respect to agribusiness and financial sector development is conducted under separate contractors' auspices. Trade policy analysis work in key agricultural sectors in Mali such as cereals (especially rice) and livestock and in the analysis of the competitiveness of Mali's manufacturing sector had been implemented by Associates for International Resources and Development from 1996 through 1999 under a USAID/Africa Bureau-funded cooperative agreement, known as EAGER (Equity and Growth through Economic Research). In February 2000, Nathan Associates signed task order subcontracts with Associates for International Resources and Development and MSI to carry out the USAID/ Mali Policy Analyses and Private Sector Strengthening task order under the SEGIR/GBTI indefinite quantity contract. The completion date for this task order was extended several times during the course of implementation. A final extension through December 20, 2001 was granted in light of the disruption caused by the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001. This report summarizes the outcomes of each activity, the results achieved, and the dissemination activities which have been held. Names of participants in each of these activities are included.

The task order was designed to deepen policy analyses and support activities for the Malian Ministry of Industry and Trade in a number of key areas related to the SEG office's portfolio. These included:

	Topic	Author(s)	Report Title
1.	Assessment of the impact of WAEMU's fiscal and trade policies	Massa Coulibaly	The Impact of the Common External Tariff on the Competitiveness of Mali's Manufacturing Industry
2.	Preparation of the Malian position for the next round of World Trade Organization Negotiations	Daniel Plunkett Lance Graef Massa Coulibaly	Opening Agribusiness Opportunities for Mali in the World Trade Organization
3.	Advocacy training for private sector associations	Deborah Orsini Gagny Timbo	Final Report: Training Workshop on Lobbying Techniques for Livestock Sector Operators, for Participants in the Fruits and Vegetables Sector, and for Operators of the Rice Subsector in Mali" (3 reports)
4.	Analysis of prospects for export of textile and tanned leather products	Lynn Salinger Patti Carpenter	Helping Mali Learn to Compete: Next Steps for Mali's Leather and Textile Exports to the U.S.
5.	Evaluation of current protection, profitability, and prospects for Mali's wheat milling industry under WAEMU and WTO	Abdoul Barry Bakary Coulibaly	Compétitivité de la Farine de Blé des Grands Moulins du Mali et Sécurité Alimentaire au Mali
6.	Evaluation of feasibility of	Dirck Stryker	Private Sector Investment in the

	establishing a non-bank financial institution for the purpose of promoting investment in the Office du Niger	Massa Coulibaly	Office du Niger: Proposal for a Non-Bank Financial Institution, ∆- Promi
7.	Evaluation of the broader economic impacts of the mining sector	Ousmane Papa Kanté Christopher Shaw	The Impact of Gold Mining on Mali's National Economy

# **Activity Outcomes**

# WAEMU Impact

Massa Coulibaly, professor of economics at ENA and president of research firm GREAT, was the principal investigator for this study. Launched in early 2001, after a year's worth of experiences with the economic and monetary union had been gathered by the private sector, Dr. Coulibaly surveyed ten Malian firms in order to assess the first year's impact of the Common External Tariff introduced under WAEMU. The survey built on earlier unit cost competitiveness data collected by Dr. Coulibaly as part of economic research conducted with support from USAID's EAGER cooperative agreement. The earlier analysis had revealed Mali manufacturers' lack of cost competitiveness, due to both high domestic factor costs and low labor productivity. Analysis of firm-level cost data suggested that introduction of WAEMU did not lead to a drop in performance. Indeed, seven out of the ten firms have adopted strategies to improve their performance over the past year.

The study recommends that firms continue to improve their labor productivity and seek to reduce non-labor costs as well. It also recommends that duties on tradable inputs and capital equipment be further reduced (or that WAEMU's low rates be strictly enforced). Reduction of the tax burden on basic infrastructure and utilities is important, as is an improvement in financial intermediation.

# Preparation for World Trade Organization Agriculture Negotiations

Through training and analysis from July through November 2000, SEGIR/GBTI partners successfully brought together key public and private sector actors in a process to train Malians in developing a WTO negotiating strategy for agriculture. Economic analyses were prepared for Mali's main agricultural export products (mangoes, green beans, cotton, rice, cattle/red meat) which highlighted Mali's strategic commercial objectives, domestic needs to be addressed, key stakeholders, global trade policies affecting export prospects and under the jurisdiction of the WTO, regional commitments, world market structure and trends, and domestic market obstacles and constraints to expanding exports.

Daniel Plunkett (AIRD), Lance Graef (Nathan Associates), and Massa Coulibaly (GREAT) led sectoral consultations and training in trade negotiations preparation analyses and implementation strategies in Bamako in November 2000 for representatives of the Ministry of Industry and Trade as well as private sector representatives. The objective of the consultation was to prioritize Government actions for alleviating trade obstacles faced by Malian exporters overseas, allow donors to identify areas of potential technical assistance, and allow stakeholders the chance to participate in these discussions. A five-year action plan was prepared for the development of enhanced technical capacity in Mali to participate in world trade negotiations. As a result, Mali

was the sole Sub-Saharan African country to submit a WTO negotiating position by the initial deadline of December 31, 2000.

As a direct follow-up to the training, Madame Touré of the Fruit and Vegetable Exporters Association in June 2001 made a visit to Washington, DC, to consult with USDA on setting up a pest assessment system in the hope of getting approval to ship fresh mangoes and value-added mango products to the U.S. market.

# Support to Private Sector Advocacy Groups

Three private sector advocacy training workshops were held in Mali, organized by MSI's Deborah Orsini and Malian consultant Gagny Timbo (GREAT). The first, held June 27-29, 2000 in Ségou, explored lobbying options for twenty-one members of the Malian Cattle and Meat Subsector Actors' Federation. The second, held February 28-March 1, 2001 in Bamako, did the same for twenty representatives of the fruit and vegetable exporting community. A third focused on advocacy needs to promote private investment in the Office du Niger during the week of June 18, 2001 in Ségou.

Participants in these workshops were trained in the principles and techniques of effective lobbying, learned how to use seven key tools for effective lobbying (strategic action planning, weaknesses/ strengths/opportunities/threats analysis, decision making process analysis, influence strategies, force fields analysis, government policy impact analysis, and campaign strategies involving direct approaches, the media, and use of strategic alliances), and formulated their own strategic formulae for achieving reform objectives they identified.

The reform objectives identified during the workshops included:

#### Livestock

- reduction in price of veterinary medicines
- reduction in price of animal feed
- review of the age requirement for livestock exports
- improvement in access to credit by livestock sector

## Fruits and vegetables

- removal of the airport license fee export tax
- removal of the guarantee fees linked to the import of packaging materials
- improvement in access to credit by stakeholders in the subsector

# Office du Niger

- creation of an extended framework for dialogue with all actors of the rice subsector in the Office du Niger zone;
- establishment of an investment credit mechanism for rice growers;
- revision of the water fee

# Textile/Leather Product Export Prospects

This activity evolved during the course of the task order from one which originally aimed to bring Malian textile and leather manufacturers to see export-oriented production elsewhere in Africa to one which focused on developing marketable products and marketing links to the U.S. market. Efforts were therefore focused on surveying producers of textile- and leather-based

products to see their technical and production capacities, and then developing production samples of a range of home furnishings and leisure wear garments. AIRD economist Lynn Salinger and product development consultant Patti Carpenter surveyed production capabilities in small-to-medium scale textile and leather firms in December 2000 and conducted a workshop attended by twenty-five artisans, manufacturers, and exporters of textiles- and leather-based products. The workshop covered product design, color, manufacturing, quality, and export logistics issues.

Carpenter returned to Mali in May/June 2001 to design five groups of product, samples of which were to be shown at the August 2001 New York International Gift Fair. She worked with Mali's premier *bogolan* production studio in Ségou (Kaso Bané), as well as two fabric dyeing houses, several independent leather-tooling studios, and two sewn-product producers (one formal, Palais de Vêtements, and one informal) in Bamako. The new Malian products were well received at the Gift Fair. The leather boxes sold particularly well (for which orders totaled \$1870, FOB Mali), as did some table top groupings and the indigo leisure wear robe (for which orders totaled \$800, FOB Mali). This is an unprecedented accomplishment for Mali's textile and leather artisans. A return trip by Carpenter to Mali in November 2001 was funded by several private U.S. wholesalers in order to ensure efficient fulfillment of orders. Malian products developed through this activity will be shown at the January 2002 New York Gift Fair under the auspices of several private wholesalers.

The most serious textile/leather sector development issues, highlighted at a final workshop with the Ministry and the private sector in Bamako in December 2001, include:

- the limited production capacity of small-scale Malian producers,
- lack of consistent quality standards,
- industrial technology and capital constraints,
- unrealistic export pricing by producers,
- lack of experienced export agents in Mali who are trained in the sourcing and supervision of high-end product manufacture,
- the need for enhanced visibility of Mali and its textile sector vis-à-vis potential U.S. clients, and
- the lack of a private-public sector strategy in Mali for addressing the country-of-origin visa requirements of the African Growth and Opportunity Act.

Implementation of a longer term coaching model for addressing these constraints should include workforce training and marketing assistance. Longer term training needs for improving Malians' technical capacities and developing an emergent level of commercial networks include technical training in fabric and leather dyeing, leather tanning, fine sewing and tailoring, and product development; management training; professional association development; and training in marketing, export, and trade finance.

# Wheat Milling Industry

The Grands Moulins du Mali (GMM) has enjoyed quasi monopoly power in wheat milling, thanks to the government's policies. Duties and taxes on imported wheat flour totaled nearly 80% until 1996. In addition to these duties and taxes, the GMM was granted a subsidy of nearly 4.5 billion CFA francs between 1996 and 1998 to enable it to sell its milled wheat flour at an affordable price to Malian consumers, following the steep rise in the price of imported wheat

grain. Subsequent to the removal of the subsidy in 1998 and the inception of the 22.5 % Common External Tariff of the West African Economic and Monetary Union (WAEMU), the GMM enjoyed an additional protective tax (TCI) of 25% to guaranty its market share in the face of likely competition from French, Ivoirian, and possibly other sources of wheat flour.

In August 2001, the Government of Mali cancelled the TCI in concordance with the rules of WAEMU, prompting the GMM to cease completely its milling activities. In addition to putting some 200 local jobs at risk, this also raises the issue of the sustainability of the wheat milling industry in Mali. Elimination of the TCI has also highlighted the economic cost of the protection policy to Malian wheat flour consumers.

The dilemma for Malian policy makers is how to strike a balance between the survival of the GMM operating in an environment with a weak industrial base and the welfare of consumers that depend on wheat-based bread to ensure their food security. In this respect, the results of the study by AIRD economist Abdoul Barry and GREAT consultant Bakary Coulibaly will guide Malian policy makers in finding a balancing tool for both the GMM and consumers.

# Proposal for a Non-Bank Financial Institution in the Office du Niger

This study was undertaken by AIRD's Dirck Stryker, with assistance from Massa Coulibaly, Kim Forsyth, and Kadidiu Konaré, following a recommendation made at an EAGER/ATRIP workshop in Bamako in November 1999, at which the results of research in the Office du Niger were discussed. The recommendation was to investigate the possibility of obtaining longer-term sources of finance for private sector investments in the Office du Niger. The present study was undertaken in close collaboration with the World Bank, International Finance Corporation, and various participants in the West African capital market.

The final report from this study examines the question of how medium and long term lending to the private sector can be increased in the Office du Niger for the purpose of facilitating investment in order to more fully develop the potential that exists for irrigated agriculture. The report offers a series of recommendations regarding the creation of a non-bank financial institution that would serve the Delta region of Mali, and in particular the zone of the Office du Niger. This institution would have a broad base of equity capital, would borrow on regional capital markets, and would direct its lending primarily towards investment in irrigation infrastructure, land development, and agricultural and processing equipment. It would receive borrowing guarantees from the donors, the International Finance Corporation, and other regional and international financial institutions but would be independent of the Malian government. The major goal would be to create a financial structure and to engage in financial operations in such a way as to become a viable financial intermediary serving the needs of the Office du Niger region.

The report was presented at two workshops held in Bamako and Ségou in December 2001. Attendance was very broad, involving government officials, research scientists, project managers, bankers, Office du Niger staff, the World Bank, private investors, and farmers active in the Delta region. It was agreed that the study was a very useful contribution to the ongoing discussion regarding how private investment in the Office is to be financed. There was widespread interest in moving towards a full feasibility study as the next step, but this will depend upon further discussions within the government and among the donors regarding

financing options, as part of the National Rural Infrastructure Project being financed by the World Bank.

# Mining Sector Economic Impacts

The mining sector study, conducted by AIRD Economist Christopher Shaw and GREAT Economist Ousmane Papa Kanté, put into perspective the contributions of both the large-scale, modern gold mining industry which has grown rapidly during the last ten years and small-scale, artisanal mining activities which have existed historically in several regions of the country. Because of the surge in growth of the modern sector, and in revenues generated to the state, its importance to the Malian economy has been over-estimated.

The report suggests a methodology for approximating the economic rents associated with gold production received by Mali. It also suggests the need for greater attention to be paid to understanding the economics of small-scale mining, which is an important supplement to the living standards of rural households.

During AIRD's December 2001 workshop, representatives of Mali's private jewelry sector raised an issue regarding access to local supply of gold. With increased gold exports by the modern sector, the jewelry sector – which adds high value through its labor-intensive, high quality processing – finds it increasingly difficult to access local supply.

# Annex Lists of Study and/or Workshop Participants

# **WAEMU** Impact

#### Bamako workshop attendants, December 12, 2001

Traoré Abdramane, GREAT Ba Amina Talibé, GREAT Simpara Ibrahim, GREAT Sangaré Keleké, SOMAPIL Mme Ag Erless Oumou Coulibaly, CMPI Oumar Coulibaly, CCIM Sinè Konaté, DNAMR Modibo Doumbia, TAMALI Mamadou Camara, SADA-SA Lamissa Diakité, IER/ECOFIL Mamady Doumbia, Maison des Artisans Kossi Makpayo Boubacar Timbo, Direction Nationale des Industries Oumar Diakité, USAID Fadiala Dembélé, Maison des artisans Mamadou Yattara, Maison des Artisans Kanté Papa Ousmane, GREAT Abdramane Kanté, Maison des Artisans

# World Trade Organization Negotiations

The institutions represented in the training included the Direction Nationale de la Concurrence et du Commerce, the Ministry of Rural Development, the National Bureau of Standards, the national sanitary/phytosanitary authority, the regional authority for the Office du Niger, the Customs Service, CMDT, the livestock exporters' association, the fruit and vegetable exporters' association, rice producers, Ecole Nationale d'Administration, among others.

## Support to Private Sector Advocacy Groups

#### Livestock producers

FEBEVIM (Federation of Malian Livestock and Meat Sector Operators)

# Fruits & vegetables growers

AMELEF (Malian Association of Exporters of Fruits and Vegetables)
APEFEL (Association of Producers and Exporters of Fruits and Vegetables)
AMEPROC (Malian Association of Exporters of Horticultural Crops)
UNCPM (National Union of Cooperatives of Malian Planters and Small-scale Growers
COPROMANG (Cooperative of Mango Producers).

#### Office du Niger

General Delegation of Agricultural Producers to the Office du Niger Faranfasiso-CPS (Association of Service Centers) CONDESAM (National Coordination of Operators in the Agribusiness Sector) Faso Djigui (Association of Producers for Collective Marketing of Cereals)

# Textile/Leather Product Export Prospects

# Study Participants and Attendees of Project Workshop held in Bamako at SEPA offices, December 2000

## Adass Ag Oufen

Leather artisan

# Association des Veuves et Enfants Orphélins de Sabalibougou

Mudcloth & hand-made papers cooperative

#### Atelier Kasobané

Bogolan studio

#### Waly Bathily

PDG, Palais du Vêtement

# Elaine Bellezza Bruno Badamie Soulevmane Goro

Project staff, Soutien aux Exportations des Produits Artisanaux (SEPA), Action for

Enterprise

# Awa Cissé

Textile dyer

#### **COMATEX**

Textile mill, Segou

# Moustapha Diawarra

Fashion designer

#### Fatim mad'in Bko

Fashion designer

#### Mamadou Léo Keita

Garment manufacturer, wholesaler/exporter

#### **Bourama Konaté**

Wholesaler & exporter of bogolan

#### **Fatimatou Meite**

Proprietor, San Toro

Garment manufacturer, wholesaler/exporter

#### **Sidy Sow**

Fashion designer

## **Tantou Teinture**

Textile dyer

# Bamako workshop attendants, December 10, 2001

Soumaré Cheick Aliou
Kanté Papa Ousmane, GREAT
Issa Bagayogo
Mamady Doumbia, Maison des Artisans
Abdramane Kanté, Maison des Artisans
Mamadou Ballo, Maison des Artisans
Seydou Niaré, Ministère de l'Artisanat du Mali
Fadiala Dembélé, Ministère de l'Artisanat du Mali
Gnaragagnan Diourté, Direction Nationale de l'Industrie
Mme Kébé Tantou Sambaké, Tantou Teinture
Sinè Konaté, DNAMR
Sikoro Keïta, USAID
Ibrahim Simpara, GREAT

# Wheat Milling Industry

Abdramane Traoré, GREAT

#### Bamako workshop attendants, December 13, 2001

Konaté Sinè, DNAMR Farakoro Koné, DGRC-SAR Amina Ba, GREAT Thiam Abdoulaye, Société ABK Bakary Traoré, Synd Boulangers Caravello Joseph . BOUMA-SA (Boulaber) Bakary Kanté, Institut du Sahel Sekou Sangaré, ASCOMA Simpara Ibrahim, GREAT Abdramane Traoré, GREAT Cyril Achcar, GMM Achcar Gérard, GMM Bakary Sékou Coulibaly, IER Abdoul Barry, AIRD Boubacar Timbo, DNI Djibril Dramé, IER/LTA Lamissa Diakité, IER/ECOFIL Amadou Camara, USAID Oumar Diakité, USAID Abdramane Kanté, Maison des Artisans Mme Ag Erless Oumou Coulibaly, CNPI Mme Coulibaly Salimata Diarra, ASCOMA Massa Coulibaly, GREAT

# Non-Bank Financial Institution Feasibility

# Bamako workshop attendants, December 14, 2001

Abdramane Traoré, GREAT Konaté Sinè, DNAMR Amadou Camara, USAID SEG Mme Ag Erless Oumou Coulibaly, CNPI Mme Yayaudé K Sangho, Banque Mondial Ousmane P. Kanté, GREAT Abdramane Kanté, Maison des Artisans Mamady Doumbia, Maison des Artisans Fadiala Dembélé. Maison des Artisans Mamadou Yattara, Maison des Artisans Mamadou Ballo, Maison des Artisans Mamadou Tidiane Traoré, DNDA Oumar Diakité, USAID Boubacar Diallo, Freedom From Hunger Mahamoud Magassouba, CAE Massa Coulibaly, GREAT Dirck Strycker, AIRD Amina T Ba. GREAT Ibrahim Simpara, GREAT

# Ségou workshop attendants, December 21, 2001

Issafor Kinta, Office du Niger Iliss D. Goro, Office du Niger Boubacar Sow, Office du Niger Aly Dia, DAE/Office du Niger Katon Ballo, Chargé du budget, Office du Niger Fafre Diarra, DADR, Office du Niger Amadou H. Kebé, R/SE, Office du Niger, Niono Souleymane Koné, Office du Niger Kadega Kalidy, DGA, Office du Niger Mohamed M. Ouédrago, Délégué adjoint Yaya Diarra, PNIR Lassané Coulibaly, BNDA Yava Diarra, SP-POP Yenzie Koné. IER Hamidou Bagayeko, PACEN- Segou Boubacar Fofana, CRA/Segou Ibrehima Coulibaly, Délégué paysans Modibo Coulibaly, Nyesigiso Bernard Maiga, MDR Madam Daffé, SOMATRA Brehima Doumbia, DZ Massa Coulibaly, GREAT Abdramane Traoré, GREAT Mamadou N. Traoré, Ambassade Pays-Bas Amadou Camara, USAID Timm Harris, USAID Modibo Diakité, CAE, Ségou

# Mining Sector Economic Impacts

# Workshop attendants, December 11, 2001

T. Marc Dembélé Mamadou Ballo, Maison des artisans Abdramane Kanté, Maison des Artisans Boubacar Timbo. Direction Nationale des Industries Dr. Gustave A Sissoko, DNGM Mme Ag Erless Oumou Coulibaly, CMPI Lamine Keïta, CAFPD Waly Diawara, DNGM Siné Konaté, ANAMR Modibo Doumbia, TAMALI Ibrahim Simpara, GREAT Massa Coulibaly, GREAT Oumar Diakité, USAID Fadiala Dembélé, Maison des artisans Mamadou Yattara, Maison des artisans Mamady Doumbia, Maison des artisans